



TRANSFER AND ARTICULATION OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE

Meeting Notes

November 17, 2011

10:00 AM - 12:30 PM

Dixon University Center

Harrisburg, PA 17110-1201

Remote Locations: CC of Beaver County, IUP, Montgomery CCC, Clarion University

Conference Line: 717-787-6164

1. Roll Call

2. August 18, 2011 Meeting Notes

- Email Julie Kane at PDE by Wednesday, Nov. 23 with any changes.
- PDE will post final notes on PA TRAC.

3. November 2011 Updates & Announcements

- a. Next TAOC meeting is Dec. 15.
 - Full participation is strongly encouraged since members will be discussing and voting on agreements.
 - Given the importance of this meeting, Clarion University was added as a fourth remote meeting location.
- b. Comment on Draft Articulation Agreements by Nov. 25.
 - TAOC members need to inform faculty/personnel as soon as possible of the draft agreements.
 - Deadline to comment on Social Work Agreement is Dec. 6.
- c. Institutions should be working with their campuses now to implement agreements approved by TAOC prior to August 31, 2011 and effective fall 2012.
 - Agreements are available on PA TRAC.
 - Bob Smith asked if PDE would be hosting webinars to help explain statewide articulation and the approved agreements to faculty/personnel. Kathleen Howley commented that PASSHE, at the request of the PASSHE CAOs, offered three webinars last year to address implementation of the pilot agreements in Psychology, Math and PK-4 Education. The webinars were only for the PASSHE institutions. Julie said TAOC will be developing a communication strategy in the spring and may want to consider something similar for all of the participating institutions.
 - Julie celebrated that two years ago to the date (today) the articulation process began and that TAOC should be proud of their accomplishments.
- d. PAC Progress reports are available on PA TRAC.
 - TAOC members can review the PAC progress reports for the current PACs to see how things are moving along.
 - TAOC members should email the PAC's TAOC rep with questions/suggestions or submit feedback using the electronic feedback form on PA TRAC.
- e. TAOC members will receive the 2nd Draft Agreements by Dec. 3.
 - Members then have one week to review the agreements and email PDE with comments.
 - PDE will compile the comments and forward to the PACs for consideration.

- PACs have until Dec. 16 to submit a Final Draft Agreement to TAOC for vote.

4. Implementing Statewide Program-to-Program Articulation

- a. ACTION ITEM: Recommendation from Steering Committee to base student verification for statewide program articulation on students' "effective graduation date" rather than the institution's "effective implementation date".

DISCUSSION:

Julie reminded the group that participating institutions must implement the first 14 agreements by August 2012, if not sooner. PDE and TAOC do not have a list of associate and bachelor degrees that must be identified under statewide articulation.

The spirit of the legislation is for associate degree institutions to identify existing AA and/or AS degree(s) *for full transfer and acceptance into a parallel bachelor degree*; bachelor degree institutions are expected to identify parallel bachelor degree(s) *for full transfer and acceptance of the articulated associate degree under the agreement*.

Kathleen Howley added that determining articulated programs really isn't a choice. If there's a program, participating institutions need to ensure the articulation agreements are implemented. For example, if an institution has a BA Psychology program, then it needs to be articulated with the statewide articulation agreement in Psychology. If an institution has an AS in the Administration of Justice, then it needs to be articulated with the statewide agreement in Criminal Justice, and so forth. Julie said it is possible for a four-year institution to identify multiple pathways to parallel bachelor degree programs.

Julie said institutions may have to modify programs to meet the agreement requirements, but institutions are not expected to create new programs for each agreement. Participating institutions may add degree programs at a later date, if they so choose.

Wade Davenport questioned using the "graduation date", given students could begin under different programs but end at the same time. That means student may be meeting different requirements toward the same program of study and causing some students to unintentionally receive the benefits of statewide articulation. Julie said the ad hoc committee and Steering Committee had similar discussions (see notes from both meetings) and decided that using the "effective graduation date" was the best approach since it would benefit the majority of students. In an attempt to address similar concerns, the Steering Committee proposed TAOC agree to the statement in the next Action Item.

Julie reminded the group of the need to apply consistent policies to both transfer and native students throughout this process. Students will need to understand that if s/he is lacking a foundation-level competency at the time of transfer, then s/he may be required to complete that requirement at the 4-year institution.

Yun Kim and Bob Smith said they agree with the intent of the recommendation but that they could not approve it as written. They wanted additional clarification for the purposes of implementation and felt that the recommendation presented did not necessarily reflect the discussion at the meeting.

Motion was made to approve the following:

- Participating institutions will base student verification for statewide program articulation on students' "effective graduation date" rather than the institution's "effective implementation date".
- Students graduating with an associate of arts or associate of science degree from a participating institution, regardless of the program, are eligible to transfer under statewide program-to-program articulation starting with the effective graduation date.

- Two-year institutions (and four-year institutions that offer parallel bachelor degrees) would indicate the “effective graduation date” at the same time they identify the articulated degree program.
- Institutions would provide the following data elements in the Statewide Articulation Database on PA TRAC:
 - Associate-Degree Institutions
 - Institution Name
 - Name of Articulated Associate Degree(s) (i.e., Administration of Justice)
 - Award Type (i.e., AA, AS)
 - Effective Graduation Date
 - Bachelor-Degree Institutions
 - Institution Name
 - Name of Parallel Bachelor Degree(s) (i.e., Criminal Justice)
 - Award Type (i.e., BA, BS, etc.)
 - Effective Matriculation Date
- Students, advisors, faculty and the public would then access the information by use a searchable dashboard on PA TRAC.

Motion approved 31-2.

- b. ACTION ITEM: Recommendation from Steering Committee to have participating institutions agree to the following statement:
“During the transition to the effective dates of the various statewide program-to-program agreements, the participating institutions will strive to be student-centered and make the transfer of credits as seamless as possible for students.”

Motion was made to approve the recommendation as presented.

Motion approved 33-0.

- c. Timeline/Process for Implementing Statewide Agreements Approved *Prior to August 31, 2011* – See table on following page.

Fourteen [statewide program-to-program agreements were approved by TAOC prior to Aug. 31, 2011](#), and must be effective at the participating institutions by Fall 2012.

- | | |
|------------------------------|----------------------------|
| • Biology | • Environmental Geoscience |
| • Business | • Geology |
| • Chemistry | • Meteorology |
| • Computer Science | • Physical Oceanography |
| • Earth Science | • Physics |
| • English | • PK-4 Education |
| • Mathematics and Statistics | • Psychology |

**Implementation Timeline for Agreements
 Approved by TAOC prior to August 31, 2011 & Effective Fall 2012**

ALL Participating Institutions	
Action	Deadline
1. TAOC Member assigns <u>one</u> Point of Contact (POC), <i>plus one alternate</i> , at the institution to be responsible for posting and maintaining the institution's Statewide Articulation information in PA TRAC.	Wednesday, November 30, 2011
2. TAOC Member sends the POC's name and contact information to PDE.	
3. Primary and Secondary Statewide Articulation POCs attend a 1-hour webinar hosted by PDE/AcademyOne to learn how to upload information to the Statewide Articulation database.	Dec. 5-21, 2011
4. Upon completion of the instructional webinar, AcademyOne creates user accounts for the Primary and Secondary Statewide Articulation POCs.	Friday, January 6, 2012
5. Statewide Articulation POC enters required information into PA TRAC.	Jan. 1 – Aug. 1, 2012
6. Statewide Articulation Database on PA TRAC goes live. (Information submitted prior to March 1 will be hidden from public view. Information submitted after March 1 will be real time.)	March 1, 2012
7. Deadline for identifying the following articulated degree programs in PA TRAC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Biology</u> • <u>Business</u> • <u>Chemistry</u> • <u>Computer Science</u> • <u>Earth Science</u> • <u>English</u> • <u>Mathematics</u> • <u>Environmental Geoscience</u> • <u>Geology</u> • <u>Meteorology</u> • <u>Physical Oceanography</u> • <u>Physics</u> • <u>PK-4 Education</u> • <u>Psychology</u> 	August 1, 2012

Associate Degree Institutions	
Action	Deadline
1. Review all statewide program agreements <i>approved by TAOC prior to August 31, 2011</i> , with appropriate personnel at the institution:	No later than August 1, 2012
2. Identify AA and/or AS degree(s) by Name (i.e., Administration of Justice), Award (i.e., AA, AS) and Effective Graduation Date (i.e., May 2012) for full transfer and acceptance into a parallel bachelor degree at a participating institution.	
3. Review each associate degree against the articulation requirements to confirm foundational content and competencies are being met and to identify gaps, if any.	
4. If necessary, modify the articulated associate degree to meet all requirements specified in the agreement.	
5. Statewide Articulation POC enters the degree name/title and related articulation agreement into PA TRAC.	

Bachelor Degree Institutions	
Action	Deadline
1. Review all statewide program agreements <i>approved by TAOC prior to August 31, 2011</i> , with appropriate personnel at the institution:	No later than August 1, 2012
2. Identify parallel bachelor degree(s) by Name (i.e., Administration of Justice), Award (i.e., B.S., B.A.) and Effective Matriculation Date (i.e., August 2012) for full transfer and acceptance of the articulated associate degree under the agreement.	
3. If necessary, modify the parallel bachelor degree to allow for transfer with full junior standing to include credits being counted towards graduation	
4. Statewide Articulation POC enters the name/title of the parallel bachelor degree(s) and related articulation agreement into PA TRAC.	

- d. Clarification: The transfer legislation specifically indicates the transfer of Associate of Arts (AA) and Associate of Science (AS) degrees into parallel bachelor degree programs. The only exception is in the field education. In education an AA, AS or Associate of Applied Science (AAS) may be identified as the articulated associate degree as long as the degree program meets all of the requirements prescribed in the related articulation agreement.
- e. Other Discussion:
Cindy Doherty asked if 4-year institutions are matching the PK-4 competencies to the curriculum native students would take in the first 2 years of the baccalaureate degree, and if so, how are they doing it. She said HACC is using a curriculum mapping process to evaluate programs for all of the agreements and wondered if anyone else was doing the same.

Darla Coffey suggested all TAOC institutions use a “mapping” process and then be encouraged to share that information with other TAOC institutions. She said knowing where competencies are embedded in the associate degree would help 4-years with implementation and advising. It also would allow institutions to establish transfer course equivalencies, which is needed when a student transfers without an associate degree or changes majors.

Ivan Banks recommended TAOC convene a committee of deans and chairs of education to discuss the articulation agreements, to map competencies, discuss accreditation/certification issues, etc. since the process may not be consistent among the 4 years. For ease of implementation, he said the institutions needed to have an open dialogue of the issues.

Julie said that the PACs included 2- and 4-year faculty and that the Secondary Ed PAC consists of 2- and 4-year education deans, chairs and faculty. Bill Williams added that competency review and issues related to accreditation were part of agreement development from the beginning. TAOC’s articulation model also provides multiple opportunities for comment.

Further discussion was tabled until the next meeting.

5. Program Articulation Committees

- a. ACTION ITEM: Recommendation from Steering Committee to allow the Business Agreement to serve as the primary articulation pathway for Economics and to use advising statements to help students understand their options.

DISCUSSION:

There seems to be no need for an articulation agreement for Economics or Economics PAC, since none of the participating institutions currently offers an associate degree in Economics or plans to develop one.

Motion was made to dissolve the PAC for Economics and eliminate Economics as an articulated program of study at this time.

Motion approved 33-0.

- b. Updates from PAC TAOC Reps
- i. Art – Yun Kim, East Stroudsburg
 - As part of the agreement, the Art PAC will most likely recommend TAOC add course titles to the Framework.

- PAC members are working well together and are on schedule to meet Dec. 2 deadline.
- Co-chairs Kim Banister (HACC) and Melinda Hodge (Lock Haven) were recognized for their leadership.
- ii. Communications – Ginny Carter, Delaware CCC
 - PAC is in the process of reviewing 1st Draft comments.
 - Committee plans to meet via Skype on Nov. 28.
- iii. Criminal Justice – Ted Nichols, Penn Highlands
 - PAC members have identified foundation-level content and competencies. The group is currently discussing Framework requirements and is specifically looking at social science requirements in Category 5.
 - PAC is awaiting clarification related to ACJS certification and CHEA before completing the draft.
 - Co-chairs Barry Noel (CCAC) and Mahfuzul Khondaker (Kutztown) were recognized for their leadership.
- iv. Environmental Science – Inno Onwueme, IUP
 - The draft agreement is developed around two tracks – one with a Biology focus and another with a Geology focus.
 - Due to the uniqueness of the agreement, PAC members would appreciate feedback as quickly as possible.
- v. Geography – Cindy Doherty reported for Ron Young, HACC
 - PAC has developed a general list of competencies.
 - PAC plans to suggest course titles to TAOC for the Framework.
- vi. History – Wade Davenport, RACC
 - PAC has the basic framework of the agreement identified. Members are still discussing a few issues and considering comments on the first draft.
 - PAC members may respond to draft comments. Julie explained that this was not a TAOC requirement but had been done by the Psychology PAC in the past.
 - Co-chairs Ron Frankum (Millersville) and Tony Makowski (DCCC0 were recognized for their leadership.
- vii. Modern Languages – Barbara Lyman, Shippensburg
 - PAC decided to have one chair, Dr. Jose Ricardo from Shippensburg.
 - PAC is using ACTFL Proficiency Guidelines, benchmarks and standards as its guide. New standards were just released. The PAC intends to review the new standards before submitting the agreement to TAOC.
 - The PAC is focusing primarily on Spanish, French and German.
- viii. Music – Julie Kane reported for Stan Komacek, California
 - PAC is on target meeting deadlines, completing tasks etc.
 - There does seem to be concern for exactly how the transfer/articulation will work.
 - John Vilella (West Chester) is meeting with music faculty across the state (two meetings, one west, one east) to get feedback and provide guidance. The group is on-task with good leadership in John.
- ix. Political Science – Karyn Sproles, Carlow
 - PAC is currently considering comments and working on the 2nd draft.
 - PAC may schedule a meeting, but for now is doing well discussing issues via email.
 - Co-chairs Peter Loedel (West Chester) and Ife Williams (DCCC) were recognized for their leadership.
- x. Social Work – Darla Coffey, West Chester
 - The draft agreement was posted online Nov. 15. Therefore, comments may be submitted through Dec. 6. Darla asked members to notify

faculty/personnel as soon as possible. The PAC would like to submit the 2nd draft by the Dec. 2 deadline.

- The draft agreement includes questions and comments from the PAC co-chair. Anyone with answers or guidance may respond.
 - The PAC is following guidelines of the Council on Social Work Education. PAC members forwarded the draft agreement to colleagues on the Council for comment as well.
- xi. Sociology – Mary Frances Archey, CCAC
- The PAC changed its name from Sociology/Anthropology and is focusing the agreement on Sociology only.
 - PAC is expected to meet the Dec. 2 deadline.
 - Co-chairs Mustafa Saatci (MCCC) and Bradley Buchner (Cheyney) were recognized for their leadership.
- xii. Theatre – Jill Murray, Lackawanna
- PAC is working well as a group and on target to meet the Dec. 2 deadline.
 - Co-chairs Michael Whistler (MCCC) and Gordon Phetteplace (Slipper Rock) were recognized for their leadership.
- xiii. 4-8 Education – Julie Kane reported for Phil Ginnetti, Edinboro
- PAC members are sorting through the 33 1st draft comments.
 - At this time the PAC is expected to meet the Dec. 2 deadline.
- xiv. Secondary Education – Julie Kane reported for Francie Spigelmyer, Butler
- The Secondary Ed PAC includes faculty, deans and related personnel.
 - The PAC is planning to meet before the end of the year to continue discussions.
 - Kathleen offered to provide the PAC with a list of degree programs approved by PASSHE to exceed the 120 credit limit.

The latest [PAC Progress reports](#) are available on PA TRAC.

c. Important Dates

- i. December 2 – PACs submit 2nd Draft to TAOC for review
- ii. December 2-9 – TAOC members submit comments on 2nd Draft
- iii. December 16 – PAC submits Final Draft to TAOC for vote

6. **ACTION ITEM:** Recommendation from Steering Committee to form two standing subcommittees in Spring 2012:
- Framework Subcommittee to review the 30-Credit Transfer Framework and related issues.
 - Assessment Subcommittee to evaluate and assess effectiveness.

Due to the time, discussion and action were postponed until Dec. 15.

7. **DISCUSSION ITEM:** Develop various ways to educate all stakeholders on statewide program articulation.
- a. Who needs to be educated?
 - b. Mode of delivery?
 - c. Topics?

Due to the time, discussion was postponed until January. TAOC members were asked to think about “who” needs to know “what” about statewide articulation and “how” they should learn it.

Here are suggestions raised at various times during the meeting:

- WHO – faculty, registrars, advisors
- DELIVERY MODE – interactive webinars, information added to PA TRAC website

- TOPICS – interpreting the agreements, overview of the intent/purpose of statewide articulation

8. **Next meeting: Thursday, December 15, 2011** – Harrisburg, IUP, Beaver, Bucks, Clarion
 Full participation is encouraged given members will be discussing and voting on agreements.

Attendees:

TAOC Rep.	TAOC Institution	Location
Richard Laughner	Butler County Community College	CCBC
Jean Berkeley (non-voting)	Carlow University	CCBC
Karyn Sproles	Carlow University	CCBC
Mary Frances Archey	Community College of Allegheny County	CCBC
John Gall (non-voting)	Community College of Beaver County	CCBC
Melissa Denardo	Community College of Beaver County	CCBC
Robert Wright	Westmoreland County Community College	CCBC
Ronald Nowaczyk	Clarion University of Pennsylvania	Clarion
Ira Blake	Bloomsburg University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Yun Kim	East Stroudsburg University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Cindy Doherty	Harrisburg Area Community College	DUC
Jill Murray	Lackawanna College	DUC
Tom Leamer	Lehigh Carbon Community College	DUC
Jill Mitchley	Lock Haven University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Libby Yeager	Luzerne County Community College	DUC
Robert Smith	Millersville University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Mark Henry	Northampton Community College	DUC
Thomas Gregory	Pennsylvania College of Technology	DUC
Diane Bosak	Pennsylvania Commission for Community Colleges	DUC
Julie Kane (non-voting)	Pennsylvania Department of Education	DUC
Kathleen Howley	Pennsylvania State System of Higher Education	DUC
Wade Davenport	Reading Area Community College	DUC
Barbara Lyman	Shippensburg University	DUC
William Williams	Slippery Rock University	DUC
Darla Coffey	West Chester University of Pennsylvania	DUC
Laura Frank (non-voting)	PA Commission for Community Colleges	DUC
Inno Onwueme	Indiana University of Pennsylvania	IUP
Bill Sands (non-voting)	Indiana University of Pennsylvania	IUP
Ted Nichols	Pennsylvania Highlands Community College	IUP
Brett Haselrig	Saint Francis University	IUP
Virginia Mihalik (non-voting)	Lehigh Carbon Community College	MontCo
Barbara Ford	Bucks County Community College	MontCo
Judith Gay	Community College of Philadelphia	MontCo
Grant Snyder (non-voting)	Delaware County Community College	MontCo
Virginia Carter	Delaware County Community College	MontCo
Emily Wagner	Kutztown University of Pennsylvania	MontCo
Victoria L. Bastecki-Perez	Montgomery County Community College	MontCo
Pete Cabbage (non-voting)	Montgomery County Community College	MontCo
Kathleen Emery (non-voting)	Montgomery County Community College	MontCo
Michele O'Connor (non-voting)	Temple University	Phone
Geraldine Jones	California University of Pennsylvania	Phone
Ivan Banks	Cheyney University of Pennsylvania	Phone
Peter Keller	Mansfield University of Pennsylvania	Phone